

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Three essays on political connections, financial reporting, and  
auditing—Evidence from Indonesian listed companies**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements  
for the Degree of**

**Doctor of Philosophy  
in  
Accountancy**

**At Massey University, Albany  
New Zealand**

**Abdul Haris Muhammadi  
2016**

## Abstract

This research examines the association between political connections and related party transactions (RPTs). This study also investigates whether politically-connected firms use RPTs to tunnel resources and mask “true” operating performance by managing earnings. This study is motivated by conflicting views on whether political connections are beneficial or detrimental to stakeholder interests. In addition, this research investigates how political connections, in concert with RPTs, determine auditor choice in Indonesia. This auditor choice aspect of the study is motivated by the conflicting views and inconclusive findings on whether politically-connected firms will appoint reputable auditors, i.e., the Big 4 audit firms, or non-Big 4 auditors.

Essay one examines the relationship between political connections and RPTs and investigates whether firms with political connections engage more or less in RPTs. It hypothesizes that politically connected firms conduct more value-destroying RPTs compared to non-politically connected firms, because they have more power and opportunities gained from their connections. The findings of essay one reveal that politically connected firms conduct more RPTs compared to non-politically connected firms. In terms of economic significance, the reported coefficient suggests that, compared to non-connected firms, politically connected firms carry out 43% more RPTs. However, the regression results show that the significant influence of political connections applies only to *RPTLOAN* (RPT loans and guarantees). In order to capture the richness in political dynamism in Indonesia, a finer classification of political connections is utilized where connected firms can be classified further into government, military, and Suharto connections. Using this approach, the study reveals that only the coefficient of *GCON* (government connection) is positive and significant, suggesting that listed firms having political connections with the Government will conduct more *RPTLOANs*. The insignificant influence of Suharto and military connections occurs because, after Suharto’s resignation, firms associated with Suharto and military personnel had difficulties in establishing a connection with the new government, and experienced loss of government contracts, distributorships, and brokerage monopolies.

Essay two investigates whether politically connected firms use RPTs to tunnel resources, and to mask “true” operating performance by managing earnings. This essay argues that politically connected firms have incentives to conduct more tunnelling compared to non-politically connected firms, due to the costs of establishment and

maintenance of political connections, the opportunity to seize the benefits brought by political connections, and fewer disciplinary constraints from laws and regulations. Such tunnelling activities cause the economic performance of politically connected firms to deteriorate and, as a result, they need to be concealed by conducting income-increasing earnings management. Essay two provides empirical evidence that politically connected firms use RPTs to tunnel resources, and to engage in income-increasing earnings management designed to mask tunnelling activities.

Essay three investigates how political connections determine auditor choice in Indonesia. This essay proposes that, because of tunnelling incentives, firms having political connections with the government might appoint non-big four auditors in order to allow them to have less transparent financial statements and to obfuscate their tunnelling activities. On the other hand, following the collapse of the Suharto regime, privileges and benefits enjoyed by firms having connections with Suharto and the military have gone, so that they have less incentive to engage in tunnelling and financial report manipulation in order to obfuscate such tunnelling. Therefore, essay three proposes that firms having connections with Suharto and the military are more likely to hire the Big 4 auditors. The results of essay three document that politically connected firms in Indonesia tend to choose non-Big 4 auditors. When a finer classification of political connections is used the regression results show that firms having connections with the government are more inclined to choose non-Big 4 auditors, whereas those with connections to Suharto have the option to appoint Big 4 auditors. Further, essay three also proposes that since RPTs involving loans allow politically connected firms to siphon resources, there is an incentive for those firms to manipulate financial reports in order to obfuscate “true” economic performance. Thus, politically connected firms with RPT loans are more likely to choose non-Big 4 auditors. Essay three documents that RPTs have a significant influence on the appointment of auditors of politically connected firms. The tendency to appoint non-Big 4 auditors increases when firms have political affiliations with the government and carry out RPTs.

Key words: political connections, politically connected firms,  
related party transactions, tunnelling, earning management,  
auditor choice, Indonesia

## **Acknowledgements**

When, for the first time, the New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade granted ASEAN Scholars Awards to pursue PhD study, I doubted whether I could accomplish this PhD journey within the scholarship time frame, as I have no research experience. After experiencing both delight and gloom, nevertheless, this PhD journey has come to an end. I would not have completed this thesis without the support and involvement of many parties whom I would like to thank.

All praises to Allah SWT, the Almighty God. I am blessed by His mercy and His grace to carry out my doctoral study in New Zealand. I am thankful for His guidance and for the strength He grants to me to accomplish this PhD journey.

The first person I would like to express my greatest appreciation and gratitude to is my primary supervisor, Associate Professor Ahsan Habib. He was also my supervisor when I underwent the bridging program at AUT University. His excellent comments, criticism, and constant encouragement have been indispensable for the completion of this thesis. His guidance on developing a theoretical background for this study, and his critical thinking have been great inspirations for me during this PhD journey. His passion for accounting research, his skills in data analysis, and his writing skills for journals inspired me to be a better researcher and drove me to an alternative future career. Also, I am very grateful to my secondary supervisor, Dr Haiyan Jiang, for her patience, support, guidance, and supervision throughout this research. She was always there when sometimes I got lost with my research and brought me back on track. The endless support from both of my supervisors has been crucial to the completion of this thesis. Their spirit and support made my PhD Journey a pleasant one which will last forever in my memory.

I would like to thank the New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade and the New Zealand Embassy in Jakarta for granting me a scholarship under the New Zealand – ASEAN Scholars Awards and for the opportunity to undertake both the bridging program of Master of Business (Research) at AUT University and PhD study at Massey University.

In addition, I would like to thank Dr Borhan Bhuiyan for the opportunities he gave to me to work with him as his research assistant and marker. These chances enriched my working experience in the educational environment of New Zealand.

A special tribute and thanks go to my mother, Hj. Masfu'ah, who never had the chance to attend formal schooling, but always had hope, encouragement and trust in me that one day I would be the one she was dreaming of. This might be the answer for her prayers and supplications when I was a little kid and we had nothing left other than hope during that difficult time. Moreover, to my wife, dr. Fita Ferdiana, I owe abundant thanks and countless gratitude for her patience, love, and caring during this PhD journey: without her support, this long distance relationship might have been more stressful and difficult to cope with. Further, for my daughter, Alyssa Nathania Reswari, I offer the hope that this will inspire and motivate her to face her future endeavours. Furthermore, I will be forever grateful to my departed father, H. Yasir; my father in law, H. Soepranjoto; my mother in law, Hj. Endang Tutik Ningsih and other family members for their endless prayers and support during my study in New Zealand.

Further, I would like to thank Muhammad Nafis Hakimi Mohd. Najib and Muhamad Siddiq Abdul Aziz for their friendship, kindness, prayers and support during my study in New Zealand. With them, I always had someone to talk to and to share with when something went wrong in New Zealand. They are my real family in New Zealand and I do hope this friendship will last forever.

Last but not least, I would like to thank Laksmi Yustika Devi and Ivan Indriawan (AUT University, New Zealand), Jerry Fadlinsyah (University of Canberra, Australia) and Gusti Ayu Indah Ratnasari (The University of York, United Kingdom) for their friendship and for sharing experiences of both joy and pain during our PhD journeys. It was empirically proven that gossip sometimes served as better treatment than real medication in alleviating stress during our PhD study.

## Table of Contents

Abstract .....	1
Acknowledgements .....	3
List of Tables .....	7
List of Abbreviations.....	8
CHAPTER ONE–INTRODUCTION .....	10
1.1    Motivations for the Research .....	10
1.2    Institutional Environment of the Research .....	13
1.3    Findings of the Research .....	14
1.4    Contributions of the Research.....	16
1.6    Organization of the Research.....	18
CHAPTER TWO– POLITICAL CONNECTIONS AND RELATED PARTY TRANSACTIONS [ESSAY ONE] .....	19
2.1    Institutional Environment of Indonesia .....	19
2.1.1    Political Environment in Indonesia .....	19
2.1.2    Ownership Concentration in Indonesia .....	30
2.1.3    Corporate Governance in Indonesia .....	32
2.1.4    Development of RPT regulation in Indonesia .....	34
2.2    Literature Review and Hypothesis Development .....	37
2.3    Research Design – RPTs Empirical Model .....	43
2.4    Sample Selections and Descriptive Statistics.....	44
2.5    Main Test Results .....	48
2.6    Propensity Score Matching (PSM) .....	51
2.7    Conclusion .....	53
CHAPTER THREE– POLITICAL CONNECTIONS, RELATED PARTY TRANSACTIONS, TUNNELLING, AND EARNING MANAGEMENT [ESSAY TWO].....	54
3.1    Literature Review and Hypothesis Development .....	54
3.2    Research Design – Empirical Model .....	63
3.2.1    Tunnelling Empirical Model .....	63
3.2.2    Earnings Management Empirical Model .....	64
3.3    Sample Selections and Descriptive Statistics.....	65
3.3.1    Sample Selection and Descriptive Statistics - Tunnelling .....	65
3.3.2    Sample Selection and Descriptive Statistics– Discretionary Accruals .....	68
3.4    Main Test Results .....	71
3.4.1    Political Connections, RPTs, and Tunnelling.....	71
3.4.2    Political Connections, RPTs, and Earnings Management .....	73
3.5    Conclusion .....	75
CHAPTER FOUR– POLITICAL CONNECTIONS, RELATED PARTY TRANSACTIONS, AND AUDITOR CHOICE [ESSAY 3].....	76
4.1    Audit Environment in Indonesia .....	76
4.2    Literature Review and Hypotheses Development.....	81
4.3    Research Design – Empirical Model .....	88
4.4    Sample Selection and Descriptive Statistics .....	91

4.5	Main Test Results .....	95
4.6	Sensitivity Analysis .....	98
4.7	Conclusion .....	102
CHAPTER FIVE– CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS .....		104
5.1	Conclusions .....	104
5.2	Research Implications and Contributions .....	105
5.2.1	Research Implications .....	105
5.2.2	Research Contributions .....	107
5.3	Limitations of the Research and Suggestions for Future Research.....	107
References .....		109
Appendix A .....		115
Appendix B .....		116
Appendix C .....		117
Appendix D .....		118
Appendix E .....		118
Appendix F.....		118
Appendix G .....		119



## List of Tables

Table 2.1	Sample Selection Procedure and Descriptive Statistics – RPTs	46
Table 2.2	Correlation Analysis – RPTs	48
Table 2.3	Main Test Results – Political Connections and RPTs	50
Table 2.4	RPTs by Industry and Year	51
Table 2.5	Propensity Score Matching	52
Table 3.1	Sample Selection Procedure and Descriptive Statistics – Tunnelling	66
Table 3.2	Correlation Analysis – Tunnelling	68
Table 3.3	Sample Selection Procedure and Descriptive Statistics – Discretionary Accruals	69
Table 3.4	Correlation Analysis – Discretionary Accruals	71
Table 3.5	Main Test Results – Political Connections, RPTs, and Tunnelling	72
Table 3.6	Main Test Results – Political Connections, RPTs, and Discretionary Accruals	74
Table 4.1	Sample Selection Procedure and Descriptive Statistics – Auditor Choice	92
Table 4.2	Correlation Analysis – Auditor Choice	94
Table 4.3	Main Test Results – Auditor Choice	97
Table 4.4	Sensitivity Analysis for Auditor Choice – <i>RPTLOAN</i> and <i>OPRPT</i> Are Run in One Regression	99
Table 4.5	Sensitivity Analysis for Auditor Choice – <i>RPTLOAN</i> , <i>OPRPT</i> , and <i>RPTOTHER</i> Are Run in One Regression	101

## List of Abbreviations

AAOFI	Accounting and Auditing Organization for Islamic Financial Institutions
ABRI	Angkatan Bersenjata Republik Indonesia (Indonesia Armed Forces). From 1 April 1999 the ABRI has become the TNI (Tentara Nasional Indonesia – Indonesian National Army)
Bakorstanas	Badan Koordinasi Bantuan Pemantapan Stabilitas Nasional (Coordinating Agency for the Maintenance of National Stability)
Bapepam-LK	Badan Pengawas Pasar Modal dan Lembaga Keuangan (Indonesian Capital Market and Financial Institution Supervisory Agency). From 31 December 2012, Bapepam-LK has turned into Otoritas Jasa Keuangan (OJK- Financial Services Authority)
BOD	Boards of Directors
BOC	Boards of Commissioners
Bulog	Badan Urusan Logistik (National Logistics Agency for Foods Price Stabilization)
Berdikari	a state trading monopoly
DPR	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (House of Representative-Indonesian Parliament at National Level)
DPRD I	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah I (House of Representative I-Indonesian Parliament at Provincial Level)
DPRD II	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah II (House of Representative II-Indonesian Parliament at District Level)
GAAP	Generally Accepted Accounting Principles
GAM	Gerakan Aceh Merdeka (Free Aceh Movement)
GCON	Government Connections
GOLKAR	Golongan Karya Party
IAI	Ikatan Akuntan Indonesia (Indonesian Institute of Accountants)
IAPI	Institut Akuntan Publik Indonesia (Indonesian Institute of Public Accountants)
IAS	International Accounting Standards
IASC	International Accounting Standards Committee
IDR	Indonesian Rupiah (Indonesian currency)
IDX	Indonesia Stock Exchange
IFAC	International Federation of Accountants
IFRS	International Financial Reporting Standards
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOSCO	International Organization of Securities Commissions
Kostrad	Komando Cadangan Strategis Angkatan Darat (Army Reserve Strategic Command)
Kopassus	Komando Pasukan Khusus (Special Forces Command)
MCON	Military Connections
MPR	Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat (People’s Consultative Assembly)
OPRPT	Related Party Transactions from operations
PAN	Partai Amanat Nasional (National Mandate Party)
PCON	Political Connections
PDIP	Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan (Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle)

Pertamina	Pertambangan Minyak dan Gas Bumi Nasional (National Oil and Natural Gas Company)
PKB	Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa (National Awakening Party)
PKS	Partai Keadilan Sejahtera (Prosperous Justice Party)
PPP	Partai Persatuan Pembangunan (United Development Party)
PSAK	Pernyataan Standar Akuntansi Keuangan (Statement of Financial Accounting Standards)
RPTs	Related Party Transactions
RPTLOAN	Related Party Transactions from loan
RPTOTHER	Related Party Transactions from other transactions
SCON	Suharto Connections
SOEs	State Owned Enterprises
STAN	Sekolah Tinggi Akuntansi Negara (State College of Accountancy)
USGAAP	The United States Generally Accepted Accounting Principles